THEMATIC PROGRESSION IN ACEHNSE EFL LEARNER-PRODUCED TEXTS

Risdaneva
Ar-Raniry State Islamic University, Banda Aceh, Indonesia
risdaneva02@gmail.com

Syarifah Dahliana
Ar-Raniry State Islamic University, Banda Aceh, Indonesia
syalia_2005@yahoo.com

Abstract

This study analyses the thematic progression of the EFL learner-produced texts in Acehnese context. This is a qualitative study focusing on the content analysis. The content analysis technique was incorporated to analyse the corpora of 40 learner-produced texts. The findings of the study highlight both prevalent and problematic thematic progression patterns in the students’ texts. The EFL learners are inclined to use the constant theme pattern with less consistency of accuracy in longer paragraphs. With regard to the problematic patterns, the students tend to find difficulties in developing the ideas throughout the texts. This is shown through the emergence of many brand new themes and empty rhemes which result in incohesive and incoherent texts. The overall findings suggest that introducing the theme-rheme pattern concept to the students in English writing classes can be useful for improving the cohesion of the EFL students’ writings.

Keywords: thematic progression; EFL learner-produced-texts; cohesion

Abstrak

Penelitian ini menganalisa pola tematik dari teks yang ditulis oleh mahasiswa bahasa Inggris dalam konteks Aceh. Ini adalah studi kualitatif yang berfokus pada analisis konten. Teknik analisis konten digunakan untuk menganalisis korpora dari 40 teks yang dihasilkan oleh mahasiswa bahasa Inggris. Temuan penelitian ini menyoroti pola tematik yang lazim dan bermasalah dalam teks siswa. Pembelajaran bahasa Inggris cenderung menggunakan pola tema konstan dengan kurang konsistennya akurasinya dalam paragraf yang lebih panjang. Berkenaan dengan pola-pola bermasalah, para siswa cenderung menemukan kesulitan dalam mengembangkan ide-ide secara keseluruhan dalam teks. Hal ini ditegaskan dengan munculnya banyak tema baru dan rhema kosong yang menghasilkan teks yang tidak konsisten dan tidak koheren. Hasil keseluruhan menunjukkan bahwa memperkenalkan konsep pola rheme tema kepada mahasiswa di kelas menulis bahasa Inggris dapat berguna untuk
meingkatkan kohesi tulisan mahasiswa yang mempelajari bahasa Inggris sebagai bahasa asing.

**Kata Kunci:** pola tematik; teks yang ditulis mahasiswa bahasa Inggris; kohesi

**INTRODUCTION**

It has been widely known that most EFL learners find academic writing challenging. It is not easy to develop this skill as it requires hard work and intensive practice. In the process of developing the academic writing skill, EFL learners tend to get exposed to the effective writing tips provided by English teachers or academic books and other resources. Generally, to produce a qualified piece of writing, the students are suggested to maintain the flow of their ideas throughout the text. In other words, the students should carefully work on cohesion. Cohesion is defined as a tight connection between sentences to create paragraphs, and between paragraphs to create a text.\(^1\) In line with this, text is considered cohesive when the elements are tied together and considered meaningful to the readers.\(^2\) Thus, cohesion is crucial since it is considered as one of the aspects contributing to the coherence of text. Coherence is viewed as the ultimate goal of any piece of writing. A piece of writing is called coherent if the readers are able to make sense of it or get the communicative intention of the text.\(^3\) Another view on how a text can be coherent is if a series of sentences develop a main idea and then it is logically structured.\(^4\)

Moreover, one of the ways to realize the cohesion at the macro level of the discourse is through the systematic use of themes and rhemes\(^5\) or topics and comments.\(^6\) The findings of a study done by Witt and Faigley suggest that students write more qualified papers when they develop an ability to use Theme and Rheme more effectively in their writings. Currently, many language teachers still focus their feedback on learners’ writing, particularly on grammatical errors which occur in the sentence level, such as lack of subject-verb agreement, misuse of verb tenses, word choices, etc. This feedback approach may not be able to address the students’ problems of cohesion at the discourse level. The studies on ‘thematic progression’ or theme-rheme patterns have been widely conducted. This may be due to its crucial contribution to the focus and the flow of information.

---


\(^2\) Afnan Bahaziq, Cohesive Devices in Written Discourse: A Discourse Analysis of a Student’s Essay Writing, *English Language Teaching: Vol. 9, No. 7; 2016*.


in a text. Theme progression is a term referring to “the way in which the Theme of a clause may pick up, or repeat, a meaning from a preceding Theme or Rheme.” It has been said that the study of this topic is interesting because it is one of the factors that “contribute to making a text a text, as it were.” Besides being able to reveal the coherence level of a text, the study on thematic progression also can be one of the measurements to determine the academic level of the text. Seeing the importance of thematic progression both in and outside academic setting, hence, more exploration and investigation of thematic progression will be interesting.

Cohesion and coherence may cause problems for any EFL learners in any contexts including the students in State Islamic Universities in Aceh such as the students of Department of English Language Education of UIN Ar-Raniry Banda Aceh and that of English Department of IAIN Zawiyah Cot Kala Langsa. Therefore, this study investigates this issue in order to diagnose the problems encountered by the two Islamic universities’ EFL students in Aceh especially dealing with the cohesion in the academic writing they produce.

**Literature Review**

The theoretical framework of this study deals with the concept of Theme-Rheme which comprises conceptual definition of Theme and Rheme, Theme and Rheme patterns, and problems resulted from inappropriate flow of Theme and Rheme. The discussion on the aforementioned points is built on the findings of the previous studies and literature.

a. Conceptual Definition of Theme and Rheme

Theme and Rheme are two notions mainly derived from the theory of Systemic Functional Grammar (SFG). Its underlying concept, however, had been the topic of discussion of some experts dated to the eighteenth century since he introduced ‘a point of departure’ and ‘enunciation’ to refer to the clausal structure. Following this, linguists have proposed various terms such as topic and comment, topic and dominance, etc in attempting to account the structural division of a clause which carry communicative

---

function. Among the terms, Halliday has favourably used the term Theme and Rheme in his SFG theory\textsuperscript{15}. This Hallidayan view is employed in this research.

Theme and Rheme are two terms which represent the way in which information is distributed in a sentence. The definition of Theme given by Halliday is that Theme is the given information serving as “the point of departure” of a message\textsuperscript{16}. The given information is the information which has already been mentioned somewhere in the text, or it is shared or mutual knowledge from the immediate context. In other words, Theme typically contains familiar, old or given information. Theme provides the settings for the remainder of the sentence, Rheme. Rheme is the remainder of the message in a clause in which Theme is developed, that is to say, a rhyme typically contains unfamiliar or new information. New information is knowledge that a writer assumes the reader does not know, but needs to have in order to follow the progression of the argument. In short, Theme is the first element occurring in a clause, while the rest element of a clause is Rheme.

b. Theme and Rheme Patterns

The flow of information between successive Themes and Rhemes in a text is called thematic progression.\textsuperscript{17} Thematic progression contributes to the cohesive development of a text, that is to say, in a cohesive text the distribution of given and new information needs to follow certain patterns. There are three main patterns of Theme and Rheme at the discourse level.

1. Theme reiteration/constant theme pattern

As the name suggests, the first theme is repeated in the beginning of the following clauses. This type is occasionally called parallel pattern.

John (TH 1) was born in Russia and was deeply fascinated with the circus at a very early age (RH1). He (TH 2) loves the antics of the clowns (RH2). He (TH 5) receives an apprenticeship in a small circus at the age of six (RH3).


The pattern of thematic progression of the given example can be drawn as in the following:

![Diagram](image)

Figure 1. Theme Reiteration/Constant Theme/ Parallel Pattern

2. A zigzag/linear theme pattern

In this model, the Rheme of one clause is taken up as Theme of the subsequent clause. See example below.

Outside my window (TH 1) is a big garden with many kinds of plants (RH1), and in the middle of the garden (TH 2) is a flower bed (RH 2). The flower bed (TH 3) is full of roses and tulips in the spring (RH3). Roses and tulips (TH 4) are my favorite flowers (RH4).

The example is in accordance with the following pattern of thematic progression:

![Diagram](image)

Figure 2. Zigzag/Linear Theme Pattern

3. Multiple theme/split rheme pattern

In this pattern, the Rheme of a clause has more than one component, each of which is taken in turn as Theme of the subsequent clauses.
The textual theme (TH 1) is any combination of continuative, structural and conjunctive, in that order (RH 1). A continuative (TH 2) is one of a small set of discourse signalers which signal that a new move is beginning (RH 2). A structural theme (TH 3) is any of the obligatory thematic elements (RH 3)...

The presented example corresponds to the following pattern of thematic progression:

```
Theme 2 (= Rheme 1a) + Rheme 2

Theme 1 + Rheme 1 (a+b)

Theme 3 (= Rheme 1 b) + Rheme 3
```

Figure 3. Multiple Theme/ Split Rheme Pattern

In English academic writing, the linear or zigzag pattern of thematic development is favored and recommended among the three. Accordingly, the thematic progression of an English academic text has a high frequency of cross-referential links from the Rheme of the preceding clause to the Theme of the next clause. Such a notice about the linear progression is discussed in most ESL/EFL writing class; however, the effectiveness of learners’ production of Theme-Rheme structure depends on how fast and properly they can understand and apply the theory. In line with this, McCarthy suggests that “low-level learners might be trapped in unnatural patterns (of Theme-Rheme) owing to limited grammatical resources or lack of confidence in a new L2, but most advanced learners are likely to have a good feel for creating topic frameworks and orienting their audience”.

c. Problems Resulted from Inappropriate Flow of Theme and Rheme

The linguistic term for the structuring of given and new information is thematisation. This involves the positioning of information in a clause. That which is familiar, given, or retrievable from the text or context is typically placed at the start of the clause, while material that is unfamiliar is placed linearly to the right of it. The two parts are referred to as theme and rheme, respectively. Although theme usually anchors a text, or highlights a (sub) topic,

---


rheme is conventionally used to comment on the theme. These themes and rhemes then form
links with the themes and rhemes of subsequent clauses to allow the text to move forward in
what is known as thematic progression.21 The need to focus not merely upon traditional
sentence grammar but also on the higher level, or combinatory, aspects of discourse is
amply demonstrated, if not necessarily recognised, throughout the world whenever
students (whose exposure to text structure has usually been confined to the teaching of
the ‘parts of speech’) fail to see the textual wood for the trees of sentence grammar. “Low-
level learners might be trapped in unnatural patterns (of Theme-Rheme) owing to limited
grammatical resources or lack of confidence in a new L2, but most advanced learners are
likely to have a good feel for creating topic frameworks and orienting their audience”.22

In the process of developing thematic progression of their writings, EFL
students frequently find difficulties in handling the exchange of information between Theme
and Rheme23. The prevailing problems are divided into three categories as follow:

1. The problem of brand new Theme (new information is put in Theme position);

2. The problem of double Rheme (a sentence has two Rhemes, one of which has never
been mentioned previously); and

3. The problem of the empty Rheme (new information cannot be presented in Rheme
position).24

Research Methodology

This section focuses on the methodology employed in this research. It comprises
research design, research data, and methods of data collection and data analysis.

a. Research Design

This study is approached qualitatively because it is in line with the proposed research
questions. The qualitative method is appropriate for the context of this research because it
describes social phenomena as they occur naturally; no attempt is made to manipulate the

21 F. Danes, The paragraph central unit of the thematic and compositional build-up of texts. In: Wårvik,

22 Michael McCarthy, Discourse Analysis for Language Teachers. Cambridge Language

23 Meriel Bloor & Thomas Bloor, Given and new information in the thematic organization of text: An
application to the teaching of academic writing. Occasional Papers in Systemic Linguistics, 6(1), 1992, pp. 33-
43.

24 Vickie D. Mellos, Coherence in English as a Second Language undergraduate writing: a Theme-
Rheme analysis. San Diego State University Theses and Dissertations, 2011.
situation; but it just tries to understand and describe. The qualitative technique used in this research is the content analysis since the content of the students’ academic writings was analyzed to answer the research questions.

b. Research Data

The sources of data for this research are the written texts produced by learners studying at two English Departments in two Islamic institutions in Aceh, the department of English Language Education of UIN Ar-Raniry Banda Aceh and English Department of IAIN Langsa. To have a thorough analysis, only twenty academic essays of twenty students of each institution were selected as the sample and become the material of analysis for this study. Therefore, the material of analysis comes from the corpora of 40 students’ writings.

c. Methods of Data Collection and Data Analysis

The students’ texts were analyzed in terms of its cohesion. The cohesion of the selected texts was identified through their Theme-Rheme patterns or thematic progression. The thematic progression was analyzed by using the concept proposed by Halliday in his Systemic Functional Grammar (SFG) theory.

For the purpose of the content analysis, ten steps of the analysis were used. First, the transcript was copied and read through to enable the researcher to make brief notes in the margin when interesting or relevant information was found. Second, the notes made in the margins were analysed to list the different types of information found. Third, the different types of information that had been listed were categorised in a way that offers a description of what it is about. Fourth, the categories were identified whether they could be linked any way and listed as major categories (or themes) and / or minor categories (or themes). Fifth, the various major and minor categories were compared and contrasted. Sixth, if there was more than one transcript, the first five stages were repeated for each transcript. Seventh, when all of the transcripts have been analysed through, all of the categories or themes were collected and examined in detail and considered if it fits and is relevant. Eighth, once all the transcripted data were categorised into minor and major categories/themes, they needed to be reviewed in order to ensure that the information was categorised as it should be. Ninth, all of the categories were reviewed and ascertained whether some categories could be merged or if some needed to be sub-categorised. Last, the original transcripts were revisited to ensure that all the information that needed to be categorised had been so.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

The content analysis of the 40 pieces of the learner produced-texts reveals several interesting findings. The first type of findings deal with frequently used patterns, while the second one concerns with the problematic patterns. Each finding is presented and followed by thorough but precise discussion in the rest of this section.
a. The Prevalent Theme-Rheme Patterns Identified in the Students’ Essays

Based on the overall analysis of the corpus of 40 student-produced texts, the students incorporate the three Theme-Rheme patterns comprising Constant, Linear, and Multi Theme in their writings. However, the students have not been able to skillfully develop their ideas logically as the thematic progression of their texts is not well-maintained throughout a paragraph or an essay. The flow of the information tends to properly progress only in short strings of texts or in about three sentences in a row. Another striking point is that the constant theme pattern is inclined to dominate. To give a clearer picture of these findings, several chunks of the students’ writings that represent logical and illogical progression are provided for further discussion. One more thing to be noted is that the extracts presented here are original work of the students without any modification which obviously contains many grammatical errors. These errors are ignored for the purpose of this research only as it aims to solely explore the thematic progression in the students’ produced-texts.

Extract 1

Success is hard to achieve. It could be take a long of journey. A lot of problem will face you and asking you to solve them. Absolutely it depend what kind of dream that you are dreaming for. If you have a big dream so you need to have a big passion. If you want a easy road so you need the goodness. At least, prepare your thing then achieve your success.
The pattern of this paragraph is as follows:

```
T1 + R1
```
```
T2 + R2
```
```
T3 + R3
```
```
T4 + R4
```
```
T5 + R5
```
```
T6 + R6
```
```
T7 + R7
```
```
T8 + R8
```
```
T9 + R9
```
```
T10 + R10
```
The drawn pattern indicates two things including how most of the ideas are developed through a constant progression and how they are not well-connected along the paragraph. There are three problematic themes (T3, T5, and T10) distracting the logical flow of the information in the paragraph. The three themes are all brand new themes that just pop up and are not previously addressed. Although only three out of ten themes are problematic, they still distract the idea progression.

Extract 2

As a Muslim woman, they are also obligated to socialize with the surroundings and caring with others. Muslim women don’t just sit at home and take care of the family, they also have to participate with the environment. As modern society, they can contribute in matters such as humanity, following positive events in the environment and others. To their neighbors, they have an obligation to glorify it because the neighbor is the one closest to us. With their fellow Muslims they have an obligation to preserve the rights of other Muslims to other Muslims such as the hadist of the prophet Muhammad is the right of Muslims to other Muslims that there are 5, answer greetings, visit when sick, meet the invitation, accompany the corpse and pray for people who sneeze. So also with non-Muslims, mutual respect and not mutual disdain is one of the teachings that Islam teaches. Women can also be an advocate of kindness to the surrounding environment. Improving themselves and continuing to do good is one of the things they should do.
The thematic progression of the given paragraph can be drawn as in the following.

[Diagram]

☐ Extract 3

*Women in Islam are highly respected. In the age of Jahiliyyah, women are very demeaned even in life kills life. They again gained freedom when the Prophet Muhammad and Islam came, they can resume their duties as a child, a daughter, a wife, a mother, and community member. They can preserved the traditions of the people especially the Islamic tradition. Many duties they must do, such as taking care of the*
household, educating children, the funds become citizen who obeys the rules. Islam also has some rules to them such as the need to cover the head and so on. Islam does not make them unacceptable in their environment, because by following all the teachings, women can still socialize. There are many things between traditions and religious teachings that can be mixed in a woman’s life.

The thematic progression pattern of extract 3 is as given below.

```
T 1 + R 1
  ↓
T 2 + R 2
  ↓
T 3 + R 3
  ↓
T 4 + R 4
  ↓
T 5 + R 5
          ↓
       T 6 + R 6
            ↓
         T 7 + R 7
            ↓
         T 8 + R 8
          ↓
       T 9 + R 9
```

The two presented patterns, based on extract 2 and 3, indicate other instances in which the students tend to develop their ideas constantly. Although the students employ the constant theme pattern, they do not seem to show any problems with the idea development in the beginning of the paragraph. The problematic pattern starts to emerge after several cohesive
themes as shown in T7, T8, T9, T10 in the pattern of extract 2 and in T5, T6, T7, T8, T9 of the extract 3. This confirms that the students find difficulties in developing ideas well throughout a longer paragraph. The students particularly find it difficult to switch one pattern to another by simultaneously maintaining the thematic progression well.

Extract 4

A Muslim woman who wants to offer herself to be honorable, loyal, and noble, she has to restrain herself. That way he will not hurt and deal with distractions or pressure with full patience. It can be accomplished by cleansing the soul of the deplorable nature and can adorn it with commendable nature. If Muslim women today want to know the friends and the life of the wives of the Prophet, then Muslim women today will not lose the idol that can be a role model in everyday life. they can learn the attitudes and the good nature of its pants. Muslim women can directly practice the nature of the wives of the apostle. because with a true role model Muslim women can behave as a Muslim woman with the best.

The thematic progression that can be drawn from extract 4 is as in the following.
From this pattern, it can be seen that the students also initiate the development of the ideas through linear progression. However, the linear pattern only continues until the second theme which is then distracted by the reappearance of an old theme which leads to another constant pattern to the end of the paragraph. This is a good sign as the students, although not many, have tried to switch the patterns, from linear to constant one.

In conclusion, the most prevalent patterns found in the EFL learners’ produced piece of writing are constant and linear patterns and sometimes the mixture of both. However, when they try to switch the pattern from one to another they still tend to make mistakes. Furthermore, there are very few split theme rhyme patterns found in the students’ writing. This may be resulted from the fact that the students are more confident to have simple ideas instead of more complex ones which can be achieved through split patterns.

b. The Problematic Patterns Produced by the Students

The aforementioned prevalent thematic progression patterns that were identified from the corpora indicate two main problems encountered by the students in maintaining the cohesion of their texts. The first problem is related to many emergences of new information in the theme positions which are referred as ‘brand new’ theme by Bloor and Bloor in his study25. Ideally, the theme should contain given or old information as the point of departure. The other problematic aspect is related to undeveloped rhemes or empty rhemes. When the rhemes are empty, they will hinder the idea to be well-connected to the upcoming details. Even though there are not many instances of this problem identified in the corpora, it is still worth addressing as an area of the writing course that needs improvement.

To conclude, the problems faced by the EFL students in maintaining the logical thematic progression in their writing mainly deal with the emergence of many brand new themes and sometimes empty rhemes. These problems can be solved by introducing the concept of theme-rheme as an attempt to enhance the idea development of any texts.

CONCLUSIONS

Thematic progression is one of the features that can justify the cohesion of any writing or text. To write a cohesive text, writers should be able to develop their ideas logically and coherently to the potential readers through any of the three main theme-rheme patterns including constant theme, linear theme, and multi-split theme or the mixture of any of the patterns. However, the findings of this study indicate that the attempts made by the students to maintain the logical flow of the information did not always lead to a cohesive text. Although they may succeed in the beginning, they tend to end up ruining the pattern with brand new themes and empty rhemes. These shortcomings should be minimized or even

solved immediately to assist the EFL learners in both Islamic universities in Aceh in particular and all EFL learners in general in improving the quality of their writing.

REFERENCES


Bahaziq, A., Cohesive Devices in Written Discourse: A Discourse Analysis of a Student’s Essay Writing, *English Language Teaching; Vol. 9, No. 7*; 2016.


